- 1						
1	PAUL B. SALVATY (State Bar No. 1715	507)				
2	PSalvaty@winston.com WINSTON & STRAWN LLP 333 S. Grand Ave., 38th Fl.					
3	Los Angeles, CA 90071-1543 Telephone: (213) 615-1700 Facsimile: (213) 615-1750					
4	Facsimile: (213) 615-1750					
5	ABBE DAVID LOWELL AbbeLowellPublicOutreach@winston.com	η				
6	WINSTON & STRAWN LLP 1901 L St., N.W.					
7	Washington, D.C. 20036-3508 Telephone: (202) 282-5000					
8	Facsimile: (202) 282-5100					
9	Bryan M. Sullivan, State Bar Number 209 bsullivan@earlysullivan.com Zachary C. Hansen, State Bar Number 32:	7743				
10	zhansen(a)earlysullivan.com	5128				
11	EARLY SULLIVAN WRIGHT GIZER & McRAE LLP					
12	6420 Wilshire Boulevard, 17 th Floor Los Angeles, California 90048 Telephone: (323) 301-4660					
13	Facsimile: (323) 301-4676					
14 15	Attorneys for PLAINTIFF ROBERT HUNTER BIDEN					
16	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT					
17	CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA					
18	WESTERN	DIVISION				
19	ROBERT HUNTER BIDEN, an individual,	Case No. 2:23-cv-09430-SVW-PD				
20	Plaintiff,	DECLARATION OF ZACHARY C. HANSEN IN SUPPORT OF HIS				
21	VS.	OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANT PATRICK M. BYRNE'S MOTION				
22	PATRICK M. BYRNE, an individual,	FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT				
23	Defendant.	[Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Opposition and Response To				
24		Defendant Patrick Byrne's Statement Of Uncontroverted Facts In Support Of His				
25		Motion For Summary Judgment Or, In The Alternative, Summary Adjudication; and Plaintiff's Separate Statement Of				
26		Controverted Facts filed and served				
27		concurrently herewith]				

EARLY
SULLIVAN
WRIGHT
GIZER &
MCRAE LLP
ATTORNEYS AT LAW

5792010.1



DECLARATION OF ZACHARY C. HANSEN

- I, Zachary C. Hansen, declare and state as follows:
- 1. I am counsel of record for Plaintiff Robert Hunter Biden ("Plaintiff") in the above-entitled action and am over the age of 18. I hereby submit this declaration in support of Plaintiff's Opposition To Defendant Patrick M. Byrne's ("Defendant") Motion For Summary Judgment. If called as a witness, I would and could testify to the matters contained herein.
- 2. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "1"** is a true and correct copy of relevant pages from Defendant's verified Further Responses to Plaintiff's Requests for Admissions (Set One), dated September 19, 2024, which were served on Plaintiff's counsel's office by Defendant's counsel of record.
- 3. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "2"** is a true and correct copy of Issue 1 of Capitol Times Magazine, which was published on June 27, 2023, which was obtained by Plaintiff's counsel's office from publicly available sources, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00001-RHB00099. Furthermore, Defendant in his verified Further Responses to Plaintiff's Requests for Admissions (Set One) to Nos. 1, 2, 8, 14, dated September 19, 2024 admitted that he made the statements about Plaintiff contained in that issue that are the subject of this Action.
- 4. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "3"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available Telegram account dated March 20, 2022, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00695.
- 5. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "4"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available Telegram account dated April 7, 2022, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00696.



1

8

11 12

14 15

16

17

13

18 19

21 22

20

24 25

23

26 27

- Attached hereto as **Exhibit "5"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot 6. I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available Telegram account dated October 20, 2022, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00697.
- 7. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "6"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available Telegram account dated December 12, 2022, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00698.
- 8. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "7"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated February 10, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00699.
- 9. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "8"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated February 12, 2023, including associated comments, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00700.
- Attached hereto as Exhibit "9" is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated February 24, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00701.
- Attached hereto as Exhibit "10" is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated March 17, 2023, including associated comments, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00702.
- Attached hereto as Exhibit "11" is a true and correct copy of a 12. screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated March 28, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00110.

2 3 4

1

13.

- 56
- 7 8
- 9 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 1415
- 16
- 17 18
- 19

20

- 21
- 2223
- 24
- 25
- 26



28

-0 |

5792010.1

screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated May 12, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00101.

14. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "13"** is a true and correct copy of a

Attached hereto as Exhibit "12" is a true and correct copy of a

- 14. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "13"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available Telegram account dated June 24, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00703.
- 15. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "14"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of a publicly available video file of the May 10, 2023 episode of *The Absolute Truth with Emerald Robinson* with the caption "Patrick Byrne Drops Bombshell Allegations Regarding Hunter Biden and Iran" from <a href="https://rumble.com/v2nal20-patrick-byrne-drops-bombshell-allegations-regarding-hunter-biden-and-iran.html?e9s=rel_v1_b, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00186.
- 16. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "15"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of a publicly available video file of the May 11, 2023 episode of *The Absolute Truth with Emerald Robinson* from https://rumble.com/v2n9tpy-the-absolute-truth-with-emerald-robinson-may-11-2023.html, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00187.
- 17. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "16"** are true and correct copies of relevant portions of a transcript of the publicly available May 11, 2023 episode of *The Absolute Truth with Emerald Robinson*, which was prepared at my direction by Plaintiff's counsel's office, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00711-RHB00715. I have reviewed the transcript and listened to the foregoing episode and confirm that the transcript is accurate.



- 18. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "17"** are true and correct copies of multiple screenshots I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated May 12, 2023, including associated comments, and which were produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00102-RHB00103, RHB00112-RHB00117.
- 19. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "18"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available Telegram account dated June 27, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00152.
- 20. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "19"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available Telegram account dated June 27, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00153.
- 21. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "20"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available Telegram account dated June 28, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00157.
- 22. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "21"** are true and correct copies of multiple screenshots I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated June 29, 2023, including associated comments, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00105-RHB00106.
- 23. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "22"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's posts on his publicly available Telegram account dated July 4, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00156.



- 24. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "23"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's posts on his publicly available Telegram account dated July 5, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00161.
- 25. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "24"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's posts on his publicly available Telegram account dated July 6, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00162.
- 26. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "25"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's posts on his publicly available Telegram account dated July 22, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00167.
- 27. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "26"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's posts on his publicly available Telegram account dated July 28, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00168.
- 28. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "27"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of a publicly available video file of the July 21, 2023 episode of *The Alex Jones Show* from https://rumble.com/v3236py-white-house-witness-patrick-byrne-friday-full-show-072123.html, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00185.
- 29. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "28"** are true and correct copies of relevant portions of a transcript of the publicly available July 21, 2023 episode of *The Alex Jones Show*, which was prepared at my direction by Plaintiff's counsel's office, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00722, RHB00743-RHB00749, RHB00756, RHB00765-RHB00767, RHB00770. I have reviewed the transcript and listened to the foregoing episode and confirm that the transcript is accurate.

20

8

9

7

10 11

13 14

12

15 16

17

18 19

20

22

21

23

24

26

	<i>3</i> 0.	Attached	nereto a	is Exhibit	··29	is a	true	ana	correct	copy	OI	a
scree	nshot l	obtained o	of Defend	ant's post	on his p	ublic	ly av	ailabl	le Telegr	am ac	cou	nt
dated	l July	21, 2023, a	and whic	h was prod	duced i	n dis	scove	ry by	Plaintif	f and	bate	es
label	ed as R	XHB00164.										
	31	Attached	hereto a	s Fyhihit	"30"	is a	true	and	correct	CODV	of	ล

- screenshot I obtained of a publicly available video file of the September 8, 2023 episode of *The Courtenay Turner Podcast* titled "Episode 305: Behind the Testimony 'America's #1 Domestic Extremist $\mathbf{w}/$ **Patrick** Byrne" from https://courtenayturner.com/ep-305-behind-the-testimony-of-americas-1-domesticextremist-w-patrick-byrne/, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00184.
- 32. Attached hereto as Exhibit "31" are true and correct copies of relevant portions of a transcript of the publicly available September 8, 2023 episode of *The* Courtenay Turner Podcast titled "Episode 305: Behind the Testimony of 'America's #1 Domestic Extremist w/ Patrick Byrne", which was prepared at my direction by Plaintiff's counsel's office, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00790-RHB00793, RHB00804-RHB00809, RHB00814, RHB00817-RHB00818, RHB00846. I have reviewed the transcript and listened to the foregoing episode and confirm that the transcript is accurate.
- Attached hereto as Exhibit "32" is a true and correct copy of a 33. screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available Telegram account dated September 17, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00169.
- Attached hereto as Exhibit "33" is a true and correct copy of a 34. screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated October 8, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00147.

- 35. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "34"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated October 8, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00146.
- 36. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "35"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated October 17, 2023, including associated comments and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00141.
- 37. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "36"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated October 17, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00148.
- 38. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "37"** are true and correct copies of multiple screenshots I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated November 9, 2023, including associated comments and which were produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00120, RHB00123-RHB00124.
- 39. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "38"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of a publicly available video file of the November 13, 2023 episode of *The StoneZONE with Roger Stone* with the caption "Sued by Hunter Biden Former Overstock CEO Patrick Byrne Enters the StoneZone" from https://rumble.com/v3viewv-sued-by-hunter-biden-former-overstock-ceo-patrick-byrne-joins-roger-stone-i.html, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00183.

26 || /

) ||



- 40. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "39"** are true and correct copies of relevant portions of a transcript of the publicly available November 13, 2023 episode of *The StoneZONE with Roger Stone*, which was prepared at my direction by Plaintiff's counsel's office, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00847-RHB00864. I have reviewed the transcript and listened to the foregoing episode and confirm that the transcript is accurate.
- 41. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "40"** are true and correct copies of multiple screenshots I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated November 13, 2023, including associated comments and which were produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00108, RHB00131-RHB00132.
- 42. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "41"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained from Amazon.com of Defendant's book "*Danger Close: Domestic Extremist #1 Comes Clean*" for sale and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00709. I purchased Defendant's book "*Danger Close: Domestic Extremist #1 Comes Clean*" from Amazon.com and can confirm based on my personal review of this book, that the same defamatory statements that Defendant published in the June 27, 2023 Capitol Times Magazine article about Plaintiff, and which form the basis of this lawsuit, are also contained in Defendant's book "*Danger Close: Domestic Extremist #1 Comes Clean*".
- 43. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "42"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated April 25, 2024, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00107.
- 44. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "43"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available Truth Social account dated February 13, 2024, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00170.

1

- 5
- 7

8

9

6

- 10 11
- 12
- 14

13

- 15 16
- 17 18
- 19 20
- 21

22

23

- 25
- 26 27
- 28

- 45. Attached hereto as Exhibit "44" is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X Truth Social account dated February 22, 2024, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00172.
- Attached hereto as Exhibit "45" is a true and correct copy of a 46. screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available Truth Social account from 2024 (exact date unknown), and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00174.
- Attached hereto as Exhibit "46" is a true and correct copy of a 47. screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available Truth Social account from 2024 (exact date unknown), and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00176.
- 48. Attached hereto as Exhibit "47" is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available Truth Social account from 2024 (exact date unknown), and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00177.
- 49. Attached hereto as Exhibit "48" is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated July 22, 2024, including associated comments and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00138.
- Attached hereto as Exhibit "49" is a true and correct copy of a 50. screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available Telegram account dated June 5, 2024, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00704.
- Attached hereto as Exhibit "50" is a true and correct copy of a 51. screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available Telegram account dated October 7, 2024, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00705.

- 52. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "51"** is a true and correct copy of relevant pages from Defendant's verified Further Responses to Plaintiff's Interrogatories (Set One), dated August 6, 2024, which were served on Plaintiff's counsel's office by Defendant's counsel of record.
- 53. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "52"** is a true and correct copy of relevant pages from Defendant's Further Responses to Plaintiff's Requests for the Production of Documents (Set One), dated September 17, 2024, which were served on Plaintiff's counsel's office by Defendant's counsel of record.
- 54. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "53"** is a true and correct copy of a portion of Defendant's document production bates labeled "Byrne_000001-Byrne_000003" that was served on Plaintiff's counsel office by Defendant's counsel of record, and which Defendant claims is the signed and notarized Affidavit of John Moynihan dated April 1, 2024. Because Defendant designated this exhibit as confidential under the Protective Order (Dkt #63), this is being filed in redacted form in the version filed with the Court's ECF system, but an unredacted copy is being provided to the Court via email and submission of the paper copy.
- 55. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "54"** is a true and correct copy of a transcript prepared at my direction by Plaintiff's counsel's office of the audio recording produced by Defendant in discovery titled "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL AUDIO-2021-08-15-10-07-25". I have reviewed the transcript and listened to the foregoing recording and confirm that the transcript is accurate. Because Defendant designated this exhibit as confidential under the Protective Order (Dkt #63), this is being filed in redacted form in the version filed with the Court's ECF system, but an unredacted copy is being provided to the Court via email and submission of the paper copy.

26 |

ll

///

- 56. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "55"** is a true and correct copy of a transcript prepared at my direction by Plaintiff's counsel's office of the audio recording produced by Defendant in discovery titled "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL AUDIO-2021-08-24-08-46-17". I have reviewed the transcript and listened to the foregoing recording and confirm that the transcript is accurate. Because Defendant designated this exhibit as confidential under the Protective Order (Dkt #63), this is being filed in redacted form in the version filed with the Court's ECF system, but an unredacted copy is being provided to the Court via email and submission of the paper copy.
- 57. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "56"** is a true and correct copy of a transcript prepared at my direction by Plaintiff's counsel's office of the audio recording produced by Defendant in discovery titled "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL AUDIO-2021-08-24-14-43-38". I have reviewed the transcript and listened to the foregoing recording and confirm that the transcript is accurate. Because Defendant designated this exhibit as confidential under the Protective Order (Dkt #63), this is being filed in redacted form in the version filed with the Court's ECF system, but an unredacted copy is being provided to the Court via email and submission of the paper copy.
- 58. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "57"** is a true and correct copy of relevant portions of the Confidential certified transcript of Plaintiff's deposition that occurred on August 16, 2024. Because Defendant designated this exhibit as confidential under the Protective Order (Dkt #63), this is being filed in redacted form in the version filed with the Court's ECF system, but an unredacted copy is being provided to the Court via email and submission of the paper copy.
- 59. Attached hereto as **Exhibit** "58" is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained from Amazon.com of Defendant's book "*The Deep Rig: How Election Fraud Cost Donald J. Trump the White House, By a Man Who did not Vote for Him: (or what to send friends who ask, "Why do you doubt the integrity of the <i>Election 2020?*")" for sale and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00710.

EARLY
SULLIVAN
WRIGHT
GIZER &
MCRAE LLP
ATTORNEYS AT I AW

- 60. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "59"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated April 17, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00716.
- 61. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "60"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated April 8, 2024, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00717.
- 62. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "61"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated January 5, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00718.
- 63. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "62"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated June 25, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00719.
- 64. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "63"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated May 10, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00720.
- 65. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "64"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated January 7, 2023, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00721.
- 66. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "65"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's post on his publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account dated October 26, 2024, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00706.

67. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "66"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of Defendant's publicly available X (formerly known as Twitter) account on October 30, 2024, and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00707.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

- 68. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "67"** is a true and correct copy of a screenshot I obtained of the website https://enemywithindocuseries.com/ which advertises Defendant's mini-series "The Enemy Within", and which was produced in discovery by Plaintiff and bates labeled as RHB00708.
- Attached hereto as Exhibit "68" is a true and correct copy of an email chain between Defendant's counsel of record and myself, with Plaintiff's other counsel of record copied thereon, between September 6, 2024 and September 11, 2024. In this email chain, my meet and confer discussions with Defendant's counsel of record regarding the scheduling of Defendant's deposition and the location are set forth. This includes a detailed summary of my meet and confer conference call with Defendant's counsel of record, Michael Murphy, on September 2, 2024, in which he offered to find a location for Defendant's deposition to take place in Florida, USA. Then on September 11, 2024, when Defendant's attorney of record stated any inperson deposition of Defendant would have to be in Dubai or via zoom from Dubai, which Plaintiff had an issue with because of the time it takes to travel to Dubai and, upon legal research, the legality of a deposition in Dubai and lack of legal authority authorizing a deposition to occur in Dubai for use in a District Court case in the United States. Since September 11, 2024, the scheduling of Defendant's deposition and the location thereof has been the subject of two different Informal Discovery Conferences on September 18, 2024, and October 4, 2024. (See Docket #67, 79.) This issue was also the subject of a discovery motion that was filed on October 9, 2024, and which the Court ruled on October 30, 2024, that Defendant would be required to return to the United States for his deposition before trial and was required to inform Plaintiff's counsel by November 4, 2024, what federal district he will choose to appear for his

5792010.1

EARLY
SULLIVAN
WRIGHT
GIZER &
MCRAE LLP

deposition in.	(See Docket #87.)	Defendant's deposition	has not yet	occurred o	due to
the foregoing discovery disputes.					

- 70. In discovery motions in this litigation, Defendant gave wild and differing claims about why he was residing in Dubai. First, Defendant's counsel said he was informed by an unidentified DEA agent that the Venezuelan government placed a \$25 million bounty on him and he did not want to return to the United States due to safety issues. (See Docket #67.) Then Defendant claimed in a declaration that he was in Ghana cooperating with an official with the Ghanian Ministry of Security who informed Defendant that criminals in West Africa were cooperating to get him in a position where he could be kidnapped. (See Docket #76.)
- 71. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "69"** is a true and correct copy of an email that Defendant's counsel of record, Michael Murphy, sent to me on August 17, 2024.
- 72. Attached hereto as **Exhibit "70"** is a true and correct copy of an email that Defendant's counsel of record, Michael Murphy, sent to me on September 30, 2024.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on this 4th day of November, 2024, at Summit, New Jersey.

<u>/s/ Zacharv C. Hansen</u> Zachary C. Hansen